

CITATION (1994) 11 KLR (PT. 23)

ISSN 1117 - 0530

KINGS LAW REPORTS (ALL SC)

VOLUME 11 1994 PART 23

8TH JULY 1994

CHIEF EDITOR

O. O. NOEL ESQ. (BARRISTER & SOLICITOR)

DEDICATED TO:

The King of kings

All Lovers of Justice.

All that are thirst of current knowledge of the Law

EDITORIAL

INNOVATIONS

Subscribers would observe that the holdings as from this volume bear titles for fast referencing. Index Highlights are now reflected on the front cover and the back cover is used in communicating some vital information. Notable points of interest started featuring from 1994. vol.

Holdings presented under HELD are still based on the ration decidendi whilst important principles of law or statement s come under Notable points. The holdings as from 1994 vol. 10 are now rendered in the exact words of the Justices. Numbering the volumes in parts is to indicate the total number of books published since inception of the KLR. All these innovations are in response to subscribers suggestions aimed towards helping readers have a fast and easy research in case law.

DELAY IN 1994 PUBLICATIONS

The delay experienced in respect of 1994 publications is partly as a result of the political crises that set the nation back for about three months. So bear with us. Delay is not synonymous with termination of publications, for Kings Law Reports has come to stay. 1995 publications that will now be in strict monthly volumes shall be promptly published by God's grace.

BREAKDOWN OF THE 1994 SET OF ALL SC

A total of 43 judgments are to be published in 1994 vols. 11-14. Forty four judgments have already been published in 1994 vols. 2-10. Observe that one case alone in this volume is made up of 113 pages which could be published as a book. It is to avoid multiplicity of volumes that the KLR is now sold in yearly sets, cover price per volume being subject to the number of pages. The actual price is the set price and cover prices are mere breakdown of the bulk price per set. Even if the total cover prices for the 1994 set is over N4,000, this will not affect old subscribers who will only pay N3,900. We request that subscribers pay the balance for the 1994 set now and get ready to pay for 1995 set upon receipt of 1995 vol. 1, vide bankdraft.

CAPRAWINO LAW PUBLICATIONS LTD.

1. Sunday Adonri v. Madam Fumike Ojo-Osagie	p. 15
2. M.A. Enigbokan v. American International Insurance Co. (Nig.)Ltd	p. 44
3. Rasaki A. Salu v. Madam Towuro Egeibon	p.68
4. Abiodun Adelaja & 2 ors. v. Yesufu Alade & Another	p. 97
5. Samuel Okedare v. Oba Ahmadu Adebara & Others	p. 105
6. Professor Folarin Shy lion v. Mrs Judith Asein	p. 135
7. Michael Hausa v. The State	p. 164
8. Alhaji Oloyede Ishola v. Memudu Ajiboye	p. 208
9. William Evbuomwan & Others v. Jonathan Elema & Others	p. 321
10. Ondo State University & Anor. v. Dr. Ezekiel Adekunle Folayan	p. 359
11. Benson Akintola Sunmonu Ige & Ors v. Alhaji F.A.O. Akinyemi & Others	p.399
12. Isaiah Ojo Asore & Another v. Sule Ogunaimu Lemomu & Others	p. 432

SUPREME COURT JUSTICES

Hon. Justice Mohammed Bello CJN
Hon. Justice Muhammadu Lawal Uwais
Hon. Justice Adolphus Karibi - Whyte
Hon. Justice Salihu Modibbo Alfa Belgore
Hon. Justice Abubakar Bashir Wali
Hon. Justice Idris Legbo Kutigi
Hon. Justice Michael Ekundayo Ogundare
Hon. Justice Emmanuel Obioma Ogwuegbu
Hon. Justice Uthman Mohammed
Hon. Justice Sylvester Umaru Onu
Hon. Justice Yekini Olayiwola Adio
Hon. Justice Anthonyv Ikachukwu Iguh

B

C

D

E

F

G

H

ADMINISTRATION OF ESTATE - Locus Standi - Where the administrators authorised one of them to hold the estate on their behalf - Whether their right of action is lost thereby. *Evbuomwan v. Elema*. P. 321.

ADMINISTRATION OF ESTATE - Loss of title - Whether executed deed of conveyance that sought to make one of the administrators a trustee - Did it vest the respondents of their title to the estate. *Evbuomwan v. Elema*. P. 321.

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW - Power to delegate- University Council- Whether Council has 'power to delegate some of its functions.
Ondo State University v. Folayan. P. 359.

C

APPEALS - Adjournment refused by trial court - Where there is no good cause for the refusal - Whether an appellate court is under a duty to review the ruling. *Salu v. Egeibon*. P. 68.

D

APPEALS - Application for enlargement of time to appeal - Where the filed motion paper is not found - When drawn up order is held to throw light on what was prayed for. *Asore v. Lemonu*. P. 432.

APPEALS - Competency of appeal - Grant of extension of time to appeal - Where notice and grounds of appeal were filed 4 days outside the extended time -Whether the appeal is competent. *Asore v. Lemonu*. P. 432.

APPEALS - Court of Appeal's decision - Premised on erroneous appreciation of trial court's finding, - When such a decision is not supportable. *Enigbokan v. A.L.I. Co. (Nig) Ltd*. P. 44.

APPEALS - Findings of fact - By trial court based on credibility of witnesses - Whether appellate court will easily interfere. *Hausa v. The State*. P. 164.

G

APPEALS - Grounds of appeal- Where issues of fact and mixed law are raised - And leave to appeal was granted by appellate High Court without jurisdiction - Whether the appeal to Court of Appeal was competent. *Ishola v. Ajiboye*. P. 208

H

APPEALS - Issue not before the court - Court of Appeal cannot set up a different case for the parties - If it must raise a new issue - Need to be addressed on the new issue. *Adonri v. Ojo-Osagie*. P.15

APPEALS - Notice and grounds of appeal- Prayer to deem attached notice and grounds of appeal as properly filed - Where there is no evidence that the said amended notice has been filed and appropriate fees paid - Whether that prayer will be granted. *Adelaja v. Alade*. P. 97

B

APPEALS - Notice and grounds of appeal - Application for amendment and leave to argue additional ground - When to be granted. *Adelaja v. Alade*. P. 97

APPEAL - Order of a retrial - By Court of Appeal in a land matter - Held to be as a result of misconception of the case. *Adonri v. Oju-Osagie* P.15

C

APPEALS - Retrial order - Trial court's failure to make findings on material issues that depend on credibility of witnesses - Where appeal is allowed thereby - Whether retrial is the proper order. *Okedare v. Adebara*. P. 105

D

APPEALS - Rules guiding hearing of appeals - Is that appeal is heard on certified record of proceedings - Legal implications of a material omission from the records. *Shy lion v. Asein*. P. 135.

E APPEALS _ Interfering with trial court's findings of fact - Not to be done ordinarily by appellate court - Save in certain justifiable circumstances. *Adonri v. Ojo-Osagie*. P.15

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW - Appellate composition of Kwara State High Court -Is by two judges of the high court - Whether s. 63(1) of the High Court Law that so provided is inconsistent with the 1979 Constitution. *Ishola v. Ajiboye*. P. 208.

F

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW - Breach of fundamental right guaranteed by s. 33(1) of the Constitution - By refusal of adjournment - Can be raised at any stage or on appeal. *Salu v. Egeibon*. P. 68.

G

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW - Constitution of a high court under s. 238 of the 1919 Constitution - Exclusion of a judge of another court - Whether State legislature are empowered to fix number of judges to constitute their high courts. *Ishola v. Ajiboye*. P. 208.

H

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW - Covering the Field - Use of the words "at least" under s. 238 of the Constitution - Whether that section has covered the field

to become self-executing. *Ishola v. Ajiboye*. P. 208

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW - Failure to hear a party before delivering a ruling - Though S. 33(1) of the 1979 Constitution should not apply in all cases - Where the point is so material- Need to hear the parties. *Shy lion v. Asein* P. 135

B

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW - Nullification of a statute - Canons or Construction of Constitutional provisions - Whether s. 238 of the Constitution intends a nullification of s. 63(1) of the High Court Law. *Ishola v. Ajiboye*. P. 208

CONTRACTS - Written agreement between parties - Is binding on them - C Impropiety of seeking to import extraneous terms. *Evbuomwan v. Elema*. P. 321.

CONVEYANCING - Recital - When a provision thereof - Is held to have clarified the parties intention. *Evbuomwan v. Elcma*. P. 321

D

COURTS - Pronouncing on abandoned relief - By trial court - Whether the exercise is fruitless. *A.I.I. Co. (Nig) Ltd*. P. 44.

CRIMINAL LAW - Murder - Allegation that the appellant shot and killed the deceased - Whether appellant was rightly convicted. *Hausa v. The State*. P. 164.

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Alibi - Appeals - Acceptance of two eye witness accounts - Whether Court of Appeal rightly upheld trial court's decision - By F holding that the issue was one of credibility. *Hausa v. The State*. P. 164.

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Contradictions - Murder - Identification of Corpse - Where contradictions in the prosecution's case are minor - Whether trial will be vitiated. *Hausa v. The State*. P. 164.

G

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Alibi - Prosecution's failure to investigate appellant's defence of alibi - When not fatal. *HauIa v. The State*. P. 164.

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Alibi - Where a witness saw appellant committing H the offence charged - If the witness is believed - Whether the defence of alibi is demolished. *Hausa v. The State*. P. 164.

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Proof beyond reasonable doubt - Murder - Whether

viii INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTERS IN (1994) 11 KLR PT.23

from the totality of evidence adduced - There is any doubt as to the date of death. cause thereof and identity of the deceased

Hausa v. The State. P. 164

DOCUMENTS - Terms not contained in a document - Whether to be imported
B therein. Evbuomwan v. Elema. P. 121.

EVIDENCE - Admissibility - Proper foundation - Statement to Police - Where no proper foundation was laid for its receipt as an exhibit - Whether admissible. Hausa v. The State. P.164.

C

EVIDENCE - Affidavit evidence - Motion to amend grounds of appeal- Where there is no deposition in respect of a prayer - When the prayer will not be granted. Adelaja v. Alade. P. 97

D EVIDENCE - Allegation of contradictions and conflicts - In Plaintiff's evidence -When not acceptable - Towards rendering trial court's findings perverse. Adonri v Ojo-Osagie. P.15

EVIDENCE - Dying declaration - Where the words used are not free from
E ambiguity - Legal implication. Hausa v. The State. P.164.

EVIDENCE - Findings of trial court - Based on the evidence before it - Whether justifiable - As was found by Court of Appeal.

Evbuomwau v. Elcma. P. 321.

F

EVIDENCE - Findings of trial court - Where supported by evidence - Whether Court of Appeal should disturb the findings. Adonri v. Ojo-Osagie. P.15

EVIDENCE - Master & Servant - Expiration of probation - No evidence that
G suggested the plaintiff believed his appointment had been confirmed - By its not being terminated. Ondo State University v. Folavan P. 359.

EVIDENCE - Presumption of regularity - Arises where an official act is done in a manner consistent with the laid down procedure - Or in a public capacity
H Ondo State University v. Folayan. P. 359.

EVIDENCE - Statement to Police - Can only be used to discredit the maker -

Where not so used - But merely received as identification - Whether the

statement can metamorphose into an exhibit. *Hausa v. The State*. P.164.

JUDGMENTS - Null and void decision - Appeals - Where the appeal to Court of Appeal was incompetent - Because no proper leave to appeal was obtained - Whether the Court of Appeal's decision is null and void. *Ishola v. Ajiboye*. P. 208.

B

JUDGMENTS - Violation of principles of natural justice in any decision - Proceedings and judgment are rendered null and void thereby - When retrial Order is deemed proper. *Salu v. Egeibon*. P. 68.

C

JUDGMENTS - Pronouncing on abandoned relief - Trial judge's finding on Plaintiff's abandoned relief - Whether the Judge is thereby estopped from a consideration of the real issue before him. *Enigbokan v. A. I. I. Co. (Nig) Ltd*. P 14

D

JUDDGMENTS - Final conclusion of trial Court - Flowing from Findings of fact made by it - Whether Court of Appeal was right in disturbing the final conclusion. *Adonri v. Ojo-Osagie*. P.15

JUDGMENTS - Conflicting findings - Wrongful dismissal - Whether trial court's findings on the wrongfulness of the dismissal - Is in conflict with its finding that applicability of Civil Service Rules was not proved. *Inigbokan v. A.I.I. Co. (Nig) Ltd*. P. 44.

LAND LAW -Application for allocation of land - Made to the Oba under Bini customary law - Where there was no prescribed form - Whether an ordinary application was enough. *Evbuomwan v. Elema*. P.321.

LAND LAW - Allocation under Bini custom - Routing application through community representatives - When such an unnecessary extra caution - Is held to establish respondents' case the more. *Evbuomwan v. Elema*. P. 321.

LAND LAW - Description - When description of land in dispute contained in the counter claim - Is deemed not to be exactly the same with that given in oral evidence. *Okcdare v. Adebara*. P 105

H

LAND LAW - Identity of land - Unfulfilled undertaking in pleading to file a survey plan - Where issues are not joined on the identity - Need for sufficient

oral and or documentary evidence on the issue. *Evbuomwan Y. Elema*. P. 321.

LAND LAW - Reversion of title - Circumstances under which title will revert to the grantor. *Evbuomwan v. Elema*. P. 321.

- B** LAND LAW - Succession - Claim by both parties to property in dispute - By virtue of inheritance under Bini customary law - Trial Court's findings of fact _ Whether to be disturbed. *Adonri v. Ojo-Osagie*. P.15

- C** LAND LAW - Identity of land - Filing of a litigation survey plan together with the statement of claim - Where Defendants failed to take advantage of their option to file a survey plan - Reasonable inference to be made. *Evbuomwan v. Elema*. P. 321.

- D** LAND LAW - Trespass - Where land was in the possession of the respondents - Whether they can claim damages for appellant's unjustifiable intrusion. *Evbuomwan v. Elema*. P. 321.

LAND LAW - Title - Plaintiff's failure to establish the identity of land in dispute - Whether the claim will be dismissed. *Okedare v. Adebaya*. P 105

- E** LAND LAW - Identity of land-Counter claim by defendant to ownership - Whether his description of the land by stating the boundary features - Makes the identity reasonably certain. *Okedare v. Adebara*. P. 105

- F** LAND LAW - Description of the land in dispute - Where the description given in oral evidence varies with that stated in the pleadings - Dismissal of claim or granting title to a lesser portion of the land - May be the legal consequence. *Okedare v. Adebara*. P. 105

- G** LAND LAW - Trespass - Exclusive possession - Grounds the right of action for damages against any other person - Save true owner or person with better title. *Evbuomwan v. Elema*. P. 321.

- H** MASTER & SERVANT - Expiration of probationary period - Whether the period was extended - Or the Plaintiff's appointment was confirmed thereby. *Ondo State University v. Folayan*. P. 359.

MASTER & SERVANT - Probationary appointment - Provisions thereto in respect of plaintiff's appointment - Proper construction thereof. *Ondo State*

University v. Folayan. P. 359.

MASTER & SERVANT - Relevant provisions - Of employment regulations Where ignored by the Court of Appeal- Whether proper. Ondo State University v. Folayan. P. 359.

B

MASTER & SERVANT - Termination of appointment - By Appointments and Promotions Board of University - Whether lawful. Ondo State University v. Folayan. P. 359.

MASTER & SERVANT - Unlawful dismissal - First claim in the writ of summons - For an order that the letter of dismissal is unlawful, null and void - Where that claim is not contained in the amended statement of claim - Whether it is abandoned. Enigboka v. A.I.I. Co. (Nig) Ltd. P. 44.

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE - Adjournment - Discretion for the grant or refusal thereof is to be judiciously exercised - Whether refusal of adjournment that resulted in denial of fair hearing could be judicious. Salu v. Egeibon. p. 68.

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE - Adjournment - Is a matter of discretion _Appellate court not to interfere - Save in the interest of justice.

E

Salu v. Egeibon. P. 68.

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE - Adjournment - Justice to both parties and avoidance of undue delay - Are to be uppermost in considering application for adjournment. Salu v. Egeibon. P. 68.

F

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE - Agreement between counsel on both sides _ That ruling in one suit be applicable to two other sister suits - Where that agreement is not recorded by trial high court - Whether the Judge's vivid recollection - Without consent of both parties - Can cure the irregularity. Shyllon v. Asein. P. 135.

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE - Appellate jurisdiction of Kwara State High Court - Application for leave to appeal - Whether one judge can determine the application - Whereas two judges exercised appellate jurisdiction in the case. Ishola H v. Ajiboye P. 208.

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE - Constitution of a State high court - Under s. 238 of the 1979 Constitution - Whether allowance is made for the court being

xii INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTERS IN (1994) 11 KLR PT.23

constituted by more than one judge. *Ishola v. Ajiboye*. P. 208.

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE - Findings that depend on credibility of witnesses
- Trial court's failure to make the findings - When the failure is deemed to deny the Supreme Court the ability to determine the case.

B *Okedare v. Adebara*. P. 105

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE - Findings of fact - Court of Appeal's failure to consider the trial court's weighty findings of fact - Though it directed its mind to the guiding principles on the issue - Whether those principles were applied.

C *Adonri v. Ojo-Osagie*. P.15

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE - Intervener - Key test for joining an intervenes whether he will directly be affected by the judgment.

Ige v. Akinyemi. P. 399.

D

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE - Joinder of parties application - Whether applicant's presence is necessary - Need to establish an interest in the subject matter of the action. *Ige v. Akinyemi*. P. 399.

E **PRACTICE & PROCEDURE** - Joinder of parties application - What a trial court should consider - Whether to wade into full merit of the case. *Ige v. Akinyemi*. P. 399.

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE - Joinder of parties - Applicant to show that failure to join him will result in the claim not being effectually determined. *Ige v. Akinyemi*. P. 399.

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE - Joinder of intervenor - Where prima facie interest in land in dispute is established by intervenors - Whether they were properly joined in the action. *Ige v. Akinyemi*. P. 399.

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE - Pleadings - Appeals - Application to amend pleadings before the Supreme Court - Type of amendment that may or may not be allowed. *Adelaja v. Alade*. P. 97

H

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE - Pleadings - Non inclusions of a relief sought is still subsisting. *Enigbokan v. A. I. I. Co. (Nig) Ltd.* P. 44.

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE - Practice of court taking down important submission - whether relaxed under Oyo State High Court Rules - Proper import of the relevant law. *Shyllon v. Asein*. P. 135.

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE - Refusal of application for adjournment - When miscarriage of justice is occasioned thereby - Powers of the appellate court. *B Salu v. Egeibon*. P. 68.

PLEADINGS - Statement of claim - That discloses a good cause of action - By Slating what is being claimed - Supercedes the writ of summons. *Enigbokan Y. A.I.I. Co. (Nig) Ltd.* P. 44. C

STATUTES - Oyo State High Court Law S. 61 - That provided for taking down in writing all oral evidence given before the court - Shall include relevant submissions made by counsel or parties. *Shyllon v. Asein*. P. 135. D

WORDS & PHRASES - “At Least” - Used under s. 238 of the Constitution - In respect of composition of high court - Proper meaning thereof. *Ishola v. Ajiboye*. P. 208.

E

F

G

H

xiv INDEX OF STATUTES & RULES IN (1994) 11 KLR PT.23

Area Courts Edict No.2 of 1967, Laws of Kwara State. s.2(2). Ishola v. Ajiboye, p.208.

Boundary Dispute (Determination) Edict NO.6 of 1977 s.2(1)(c). Evbuowman v. Elema. P.321.

- B Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria 1979, 8s.221(1), 238, 239, 236, 275(1), 274(1), 214, 237, 111. Ishola v. Ajiboye. P.208; s.33(1). Salu v. Egeibon. P.68 Shyllon v. Asein. P.135.

- Constitution of Northern Nigeria 1963 (Cap.1 Laws of Northern Nigeria 1963)
C ss. 50(1), 51(3), 53(4)(b). Ishola v. Ajiboye. P.208.

Court of Appeal Rules 0.3 r.15. Ishola v. Ajiboye. P.208; 0.3r. 22. Salu v. Egeibon. P.68

- D Electoral Act. 1982. s.119(3). Ishola v. Ajiboye. P.208

Evidence Act ss.108(iii). 96(l)(c) & (2)(c), 131. Shyllon v. Asein, P.135; ss. 108. 209. 33. 199. 208. Hausa v. The State. P.164.

- E High Court Law of Northern Nigeria Cap.49, 1963, ss.62, 63(1), 116, 80, 40(1), 38. Ishola v. Ajiboye. P.208.

Lagos State High Court (Civil Procedure) Rules, 1972 0.13 rr.14, 15, & 20, 0.13 r.19. Ige v. Akinyemi. P.399.

- F Nigeria (Constitution) Order in Council, 1960, s.3(2). Ishola v. Ajiboye. P.208

Ogun State High Court (Civil Procedure) Rules 0.26 r.IO(I), 0.28 r.II(3). Salu v. Egeibon. P.68

- G Oyo State High Court (Civil Procedure) Rules 0.10 r.I. 0.31 r.4. Shyllon v. Asein. P.135

- Oyo State High Court Law (Cap.46 vol. III Laws of Oyo State) 5.61. Shyllon v. Asein. P.135
H